

EMPLOYEES' ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT: A STUDY OF THE EFFECTS OF PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT, CAREER PLANNING, AND BANKING EMPLOYEE PARTICIPATIONS

Silvy Sondari Gadzali

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.37178/ca-c.23.1.297>

Silvy Sondari Gadzali. Faculty of Administrative Science Subang University
Email: silvysondari@unsub.ac.id

Abstract

Many empiric types of research have been conducted on the antecedents of employee organizational commitment. However, there is still little research that examines the effect of HR management praxis such as performance appraisal systems, career planning systems, and employee participation on organizational commitment. In this study, the effect of these three variables was tested in explaining employee work commitments in the banking sector in West Java. Based on a survey of 98 employees in 20 private banks in West Java, this study uses regression analysis, correlation analysis, and G-test to test hypotheses. The results showed that the performance appraisal system, career planning system and employee participation significantly influence employee work commitment. This result also indicates that employees' level of organizational commitment in the private banking sector in West Java is low. Therefore, this study suggests that for employees to be truly committed to their work, companies must make objective efforts to manage performance appraisals, career planning, and employee participation to ensure effective implementation and achieve expected results.

Keywords: Performance appraisal system, career planning, employee participation, organizational commitment.

Introduction

An energetic, competent, passionate, productive, innovative, and highly committed Human Resources (HR) is the most important factor of success in the business world nowadays, which is increasingly volatile and competitive. Being aware that HR is a valuable asset and has become the source of advantages in competitiveness, a company needs to pay attention to the effectiveness of their employee's performance appraisal system, career planning, and participation. In addition, it is crucial for a company to observe the significant impact of those practices on improving the employee's work commitments. The success, endurance, and competitiveness of an organization depend on the commitment of its members, and it can rely on how satisfied the employee is toward the company appraisal mechanism, participation in taking a decision, and career planning strategy. Therefore, the organizational commitment concept contributes deeply to the HR management philosophy. As addressed by [1-3] HR management was design to optimize organizational integration, employee commitment, flexibility and

working quality [4-6].

It is essential to understand the relationship between individuals and organizations in the organizational commitment concept framework. In many works of literature on behavioural science and management, organizational commitment was viewed as a vital factor in connecting individuals and organizations. For instance, organizational commitment is the factor that encourages individual attachment to the organization [7-9]. An employee who voluntarily connects to the organization and pours every effort to achieve organizational objectives can have organizational commitment [5, 10-13].

The issue related to organizational commitment becomes rather important because of its relationship with a propensity to leave and turnover [14]. Meanwhile, it was found that many antecedents from organizational commitment, HR management practices such as employee participation system, performance appraisal, and career planning system were not much used to determine organizational commitment antecedent. Therefore, the general purpose of this study is to find out the performance appraisal system, career planning, and employee participation toward organizational commitment on bank's employees in West Java. The research objective is to test how far the extent of the bank's employee working commitment in West Java and test the connection between organizational commitment and performance appraisal system, career planning, and employee's participation in the banking sector in West Java.

Literature Review Organizational Commitment

Organizational commitment refers to how much individual identification and involvement in an organization. Organizational commitment consists of three factors: the strong will to stay as a company member; strong faith and acceptance toward organizational objectives and values; and readiness to give extensive effort for company interest [15-17].

Another definition of organizational commitment stresses the importance of personal emotion, price, and values in building the commitment. Furthermore, it is revealed that organizational commitment has three components, i.e., affective component, sustainable commitment, and normative commitment [14, 18, 19]. The three was stated as output from emotional attachment (affective commitment), price to pay if one gets out, such as losing benefit or seniority (sustainable commitment), and individual personal values (normative commitment).

An affective commitment was related to employee's attachment toward identification and involvement within the organization. Hence, affective commitment to the organization can be characterized by various values, will to maintain membership, and working without expecting benefit from the company. Employees try to maintain their membership [7, 15, 20, 21]. Affective commitment refers to a sense of belonging and attachment to the organization; this commitment has been associated with personal characteristics, organizational structure, and work experience, for example, salary, supervision, clarity of the role, and skill variety [16].

On the other hand, employee commitment refers to how employees assess whether the cause of leaving the organization is greater than staying in the organization. Employees who perceive that the 'price' to pay for leaving the organization is greater than the opposite will stay with the company because they need it. In other words, individuals do not leave the organization for fear of losing benefits, reducing their salary, or being unable to find another job [2, 22, 23].

Normative commitment refers to the employee's feeling related to the obligation to stay in the organization. An individual commits and stays in a company due to their obligation. Such feelings can arise from various sources. For example, the

company has invested resources in providing training for its employees, who feel they have a moral obligation to devote energy to the job and stay with the company to be rewarded for their obligations [24]. This commitment can also reflect instilled norms, which were formed before joining the company through family or other social processes, that a person must be loyal to his company.

Performance Appraisal System

Virtually, all organization has many ways, formal or informal, to appraise their employee's performance. Performance appraisal is a procedure that includes (i) setting work standards, (ii) assessing employee's actual performance related to these standards, and (iii) providing feedback to employees to motivate the employees to eliminate performance deficiencies or to continue showing performance above the standard [25].

Therefore, the company can monitor the employee's behaviour and attitude development through an appraisal mechanism. This assessment-based information can be applied to modify selection practices and training practices to select and develop expected employee behaviors and attitudes. However, the effectiveness of skilled employees will be limited unless they are encouraged to do their jobs .

Performance appraisal will be effective if it is conducted fairly and objectively. Fair is based on the standard agreed, and the objective was the values given conforming to the achievement level. In order for the appraisal to be fair, five elements need to look for: a clear performance target; the target agreed together; the target related to the job description; face-to-face meeting and discussion. Meanwhile, to make an objective appraisal, one must consider six following elements, e.g., employee's positive behavior and actual data, courage or firmness; structured appraisal system; uncomplex forms; appraising ability [21, 26]

Career Planning

A career planning is a process carried out with many consideration, in which, in the process, the individual aware of his skill, passion, knowledge, motivation, others personal characteristics; obtain information regarding opportunities and options; identify their career-related goals, and develop action plans to achieve these goals. A well-functioning career planning system will encourage employees to be more responsible for their development, including their skills development, which is considered important (Park, 2015). Progress chances followed by well-planned career development will produce high motivation for the employee, influencing the company's performance [16].

Participation is about how employees contribute largely to a decision-making process. Employee participation is a setting that ensures employees have the same chances to influence management decisions and contribute to

organizational performance. The participation level of non-managerial employees in decision making varies from company to company. Research has shown that organizational performance is positively related to employee performance, satisfaction, and productivity .The purpose of employee's participation, as explained by[21] is as follows:

- a. Addressing unsatisfied individuals to fix the problem with management or preventing worsen relationship;
- b. Expressing collective organization – providing strength sources functioned as a balancer for management;
- c. Contributing for management decision making – to improve organization, quality, and working productivity; and
- d. Demonstrating mutualism and cooperative relationship – to achieve long-term sustainability for employee and company.

There are relatively few researches that connect performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation with organizational commitment. Therefore, we present empirical findings that connect organizational commitment with several concepts such as leadership style, intention to leave, and working satisfaction. HR management practices, leadership style, and trust in the organization are some of the organizational factors associated with organizational commitment [16, 18, 19].

In their research, [22, 24, 27] test how participatory management and supervisory feedback influence the employee's level of normative commitment, sustainable commitment, and affective commitment. The researcher revealed that when supervisors give feedback related to performance and allow workers to participate in decision making, their affective commitment level is stronger than their normative and sustainability commitment level. Thus, these employees show that they remain in the company not because they need or have to but rather because they want to stay.

A study [28-31] examines the relationship between affective commitment, sustainable commitment, and normative commitment with other commitment types, e.g., job involvement and career commitment. The research shows that effective commitment has a stronger correlation with all types of commitment. In other words, employees stay with the company because they want it to have a higher level of commitment to their work and career.

The importance of training in developing committed employees cannot be underestimated. Training encourages a sense of belonging among employees. The executive development program also seems to be a platform to produce employees who have a strong commitment. Research by [32] found that employee expectations were usually not met and that the job characteristics, training and development, and compensation and fairness were related to satisfaction and commitment. It also found that commitment is significantly related to trust, job involvement, and job satisfaction.

[22, 27, 33, 34] study correlation between leadership style and commitment, he finds that leadership style 'consideration' has a greater influence on commitment than task-oriented style. Organizational commitment give a platform for the employee to survive in the organization.

Job satisfaction and affective commitment will be positively related to performance and leadership in general, while sustainable commitment shows a negative relationship. As predicted, job satisfaction was positively related to performance, although it was not to leadership. Continuity commitment was negatively related to both performance and leadership. Increased organizational commitment was also positively associated with valuable organizational outcomes, including performance ratings, decreased intention to seek a new job, and decreased interest to leave the job [35, 36].

There is a positive correlation between resource enrichment and affective and normative commitment and a connection between sustainable commitment and negative resource enrichment. As a result, employees who stay in the organization because of their own desires show higher involvement and enjoy work activities. Meanwhile, employees who stay in the organization because they feel they have to show lower involvement and dissatisfaction with work activities [31, 37-39]. This study examines the relationship between effective, sustainable, and normative commitments with non-occupational factors of resource enrichment.

We developed the following model based on the literature related to performance appraisal, career planning, employee participation, and organizational commitment. This model is built over the fact that effective performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation will influence the increment of employee commitment.

BPR bank employees in Garut have a good perception of organizational support in their work; they are also satisfied with their current job and have a high

affective commitment level. Perception of organizational support has a significant positive effect on job satisfaction but does not significantly affect affective commitment.

Perception of organizational support has a significant positive effect on job satisfaction but does not significantly affect affective commitment. While working satisfaction has a significant positive effect on affective commitment. The data processing results using a macro process find a mediating element of working satisfaction in the relationship between perceived organizational support and affective commitment [25, 30, 32].

The research is on the influence of leadership style on the high level of organizational commitment mediated by working satisfaction and trust in the biggest bank's employees in Jakarta Central Capital. This study concludes that a positive influence of leadership style on organizational commitment is mediated by working satisfaction and trust [1, 40].

The research on 39 companies of the banking sector in East Java aims to determine the influence of external organizational support toward employee's commitment, the influence of internal organizational support toward employee's commitment, the influence of employee's commitment on the company's success. The research findings show that the perception of external organizational support has a positive and significant effect on employee commitment; the perception of internal organizational support has a positive and significant effect on employee commitment [2].

To answer the objectives of this study, the following hypothesis is made based on a literature review related to performance appraisal, career planning, employee participation and organizational commitment:

H1: Performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation have no significant effect on organizational commitment.

H2: The level of organizational commitment in the banking sector in West Java is high.

H3: There is no significant relationship between organizational commitment, performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation.

Research Method

The population of this study were all employees of 20 private banks in West Java. The analysis unit in this study was a private bank operating in West Java. In addition, the research also employed a multi-rater response approach. Then three questionnaires were sent to each bank at the main branch office level, which was targeted to fill out the questionnaire and become research respondents. Meanwhile, the sample consists of 98 people who were recruited based on simple random sampling. This study applied qualitative methods so that the outputs rely heavily on the validity and reliability of the data obtained from the interview process through the distribution of questionnaires.

Furthermore, the sample filled in the data and collected used as processed descriptive statistics, correlation analysis, and multiple regression analysis. G-test was used to determine whether there was a significant difference between the observed level of organizational commitment and the expected value. While regression analysis determines the predictors of performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation on organizational commitment, correlation analysis determines the relationship between the independent and dependent variables.

In this study, the items used to operate performance appraisal, career planning, employee participation and organizational commitment were taken from measuring instruments validated and tested for reliability previously and adjusted to the research objectives.

Organizational commitment is measured by modifying the Organizational Commitment Questionnaire instrument. The study conducts modifications to fit the context of this research. Overall, an organizational commitment was measured using an instrument consisting of 15 items measured using a 5-point scale. Performance appraisal, career planning, employee participation are measured using a validated scale.

Performance appraisal is measured using a scale consisting of 8 items. Respondents were asked to indicate the extent to which performance was evaluated based on quantifiable results and the use of performance appraisal data. In other words, they were asked to choose a scale of 1 (strongly disagree) to 5 (strongly agree) on statements related to the praxis of their workplace performance appraisal system. Career planning is measured using an instrument consisting of 7 items which are measured using a 5-point scale. Respondents were asked to answer statements regarding the practices in the career planning system in their workplace.

Employee participation was measured using a scale consisting of 3 items. Respondents were asked to respond to statements about the extent to which superiors allow employees to participate in decision making and provide opportunities to provide suggestions for improvement.

Research model, which based on conceptual framework, is presented as follows:

Organizational Commitment = f (Performance Appraisal System, Career Planning, Employee Participation)

$$(1) OC = f(PA, CP, EP)$$

$$(2) OC = \beta_0 + PAS\beta_1 + CPS\beta_2 + EP\beta_3 + e(3)$$

By which,

OC = Organizational Commitment; *PAS* = Performance Appraisal System; *CPS* = Career Planning System; *EP* = Employee Participation; β_0 = constant term; β_1 , β_2 dan β_3 = Performance Appraisal Coefficient, career planning, and employee participation, and *e* = error term.

Result and Discussion

Of the 98 questionnaires distributed to 20 banks, 84 questionnaires were filled out and returned properly. It represents a response rate of 89.4 percent so that the analysis was carried out based on 84 completed questionnaires and is feasible for further analysis.

Of the 84 respondents, 54 people or 64.3 percent, were as Assistant Managers or more, while the other 35.7 percent respondents were below managerial positions. It showed that the respondents belong to upper-class employees. Thirty-five percent of respondents have a base in the HR department. Twenty-four percent of respondents worked in Marketing, while 30 percent were in Operations. The remaining 11 percent were located in other departments such as the risk management department, legal department, and other support units in their respective companies.

Seventy-five percent majority the respondents have at least five years of work experience. It shows that respondents have taken their careers seriously and devoted their time to understand how the issues discussed in this study will affect them. 68 percent of respondents were male, while 32 percent were female. About 84 percent are over 35 years old. At the same time, the average respondents' age is 46.4 years.

Cronbach alpha reliability tests and item-to-total correlations were calculated to identify issues related to common method variance and assess several scales' internal consistency. Items with low item-to-total correlation indicate that the item does not reflect the construct used or has entered into another construct

dimension. From the calculations, as shown in Table 2, the Cronbach Alpha value of 0.92 is above the minimum limit of 0.70, while the item-to-total correlation is above the recommended value of 0.5. Therefore, these results indicate a high level of internal consistency of the scale used.

Hypothesis 1 testing was carried out by considering performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation have a significant influence on organizational commitment with multiple correlations (R) of 0.83 and adjusted R2 of 0.71. It shows that 71% of the variation in organizational commitment is explained by three variables, e.g, performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation. The standard coefficients of career appraisal, performance planning, and employee participation are shown in table 3. Thus, hypothesis 1, which states that performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation has no significant effect on organizational commitment, is proven.

Table 1

Descriptive Statistic and Item-to-Total Correlation

	Mean	SD	Item-to total Correlations
Performance Appraisal	28.43	2.74	.885
Career Planning	26.14	2.63	.906
Employee Participation	10.71	0.91	.707
Organizational Commitment	41.21	5.95	.830

Testing hypothesis 2 states that the level of organizational commitment in the banking sector in West Java is high. The average score of organizational commitment is 41.21; in other words, the employee's working commitment level in the banking sector in West Java is at a moderate level (54.9%). To test the significance of employee's work commitment in the banking sector in West Java, we calculated the G-test to ensure whether the level of organizational commitment, as shown above, is significantly different from the expected level of commitment. It

can be emphasized that to be able in the middle (moderate) level, and the organizational commitment value should not be less than 55%. Therefore, the value used in calculating the G-test is 55%.

The critical value (critical value) χ^2 for the degrees of freedom is 13 (N-1), at the 95% confidence level is 24.25. Since the empirical value (the calculated value G) is 9,039 and less than 24.25, it can be said that the result is not statistically significant. Therefore, the null hypothesis (H0) states that the organizational commitment level in the banking sector in West Java is high and rejected.

Table 2

Standard Regression Model Results

	Standard Coefficient	t-values
Performance Appraisal	0.463	0.434
Career Planning	0.131	0.116
Employee Participation	0.339	1.414
R	0.844	
R2	0.627	
F-Value	8.288*	

Hypothesis 3 testing, which states no significant relationship between organizational commitment and performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation, was proven and acceptable.

As shown in table 4, a positive and significant relationship exists between the performance appraisal system and organizational commitment with a 0.57 zero-order correlation. Parallel to the result, the career planning system and employee participation were also found to be associated with organizational commitment with values of 0.59 and 0.63.

Table 3

Matrix Correlation of Measurement Variable

Variable	1	2	3	4
Performance Appraisal	1.00	.96**	.48*	.57*
Career Planning Employee Participation		1.00	.54*	* .59*
Organizational Commitment				* .63*
				1.00

Note: ** 0.01 Significance Level; * 0.05 Significance Level.

The main purpose of this study was to determine the influence of performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation on organizational commitment. The research results confirm that performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation are the main antecedents of organizational commitment. These results indicating performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation positively and significantly influence organizational commitment. It shows that the higher HR value practices, the higher employee work commitment and organizational commitment level.

The research findings also show that the organizational commitment level of private banking employees in West Java is low. This finding confirms the research hypothesis that private bank employees in West Java are less committed to their jobs than companies committed to their employees. In addition, low organizational commitment will be the cause of declining performance. Employees only make their current job temporary and serve as a stepping stone to find their desired work and fulfil work experience qualifications because many employees do not want to work at the bank for a long time.

The results also show that organizational commitment is positively related to employee performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation. It means that the higher the level of performance appraisal, career planning and employee participation, the higher the level of organizational commitment.

Conclusion

The research results show that performance appraisal, career development, and employee participation positively influence organizational commitment. Moreover, the study results also show that the level of organizational commitment in the banking sector in West Java is low. To a large extent, these results prove 'value-added; from performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation in increasing organizational commitment [16, 21].

Implication on further research is that some questions are left that might need to be answered regarding the low working commitment in the private banking sector in West Java, whether the interaction between these variables can be ignored because it is only a form of statistical data specification and procedural problems?

Or can it be related to the interaction of other variables besides performance appraisal, career planning, and employee participation? With a more specific research purpose discussing these questions, it is hoped that they can better explain the existing phenomena.

Nevertheless, for the employee to commit to the company, the research suggests that the related company make their best effort in managing performance appraisal, career planning, and strategic employee participation to ensure effective implementation. This matter can be achieved by ensuring that the employee puts their faith in the performance appraisal system[24, 36] the appraisal system strongly influences individual and team behavior[19] The company provide a clear and bright career path to the employee[1, 2, 40-42] the company plans career and employee's development the employee has the opportunity to propose improvements

REFERENCES

1. Roxas, M.L. and J.Y. Stoneback, *The importance of gender across cultures in ethical decision-making*. Journal of Business Ethics, 2004. **50**(2): p. 149-165 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1023/B:BUSI.0000022127.51047.ef>.
2. Soeharto, T.N.E.D. and M.W. Kuncoro, *Husband's support and job satisfaction mediated by work-family conflict in working mothers*. Jurnal Psikologi, 2015. **42**(3): p. 207-216 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.22146/jpsi.9909>.
3. Irgin, P. and I.H. Erten, *Exploring the role of strategy instruction: Young learners' listening performance and strategy use*. Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics, 2020. **6**(3): p. 415-441 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32601/ejal.834676>.
4. Amirbek, A., et al., *THE CENTRAL ASIAN COUNTRIES IN THE GLOBAL ECONOMY: THE CHALLENGES OF ECONOMIC INTEGRATION*. Central Asia & the Caucasus (14046091), 2020. **21**(1) DOI: <https://doi.org/10.37178/ca-c.20.1.09>.
5. Stopić, Z., *Croatia and the Chinese "17+ 1" Cooperation Framework*. Croatian International Relations Review, 2020. **26**(86): p. 130-154 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.37173/cirr.26.86.5>.
6. Kengatharan, N., *The Effects of Teacher Autonomy, Student Behavior and Student Engagement on Teacher Job Satisfaction*. Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice, 2020. **20**(4): p. 1-15.
7. Alexandri, M.B. and F. Zahra, *Industrial Relations: Comparison of Spirituality at Work and Organizational Effectiveness between India and Indonesia*. AdBispreneur: Jurnal Pemikiran dan Penelitian Administrasi Bisnis dan Kewirausahaan, 2017. **2**(2) DOI: <https://doi.org/10.24198/adbispreneur.v2i2.13184>.
8. Mas-Machuca, M., J. Berbegal-Mirabent, and I. Alegre, *Work-life balance and its relationship with organizational pride and job satisfaction*. Journal of Managerial Psychology, 2016. **13**(3) DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1108/JMP-09-2014-0272>.
9. Khoram, A., A.D. Bazvand, and J.S. Sarhad, *Error feedback in second language speaking: Investigating the impact of modalities of error feedback on intermediate EFL students' speaking ability*. Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics, 2020. **6**(1): p. 63-80 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32601/ejal.710205>.
10. Brookes, G., *Glyphosate use in Asia and implications of possible restrictions on its use*. AgBioForum, 2019. **22**: p. 1-26.
11. Bukkuri, A., *Optimal control analysis of combined chemotherapy-immunotherapy treatment regimens in a PKPD cancer evolution model*. Biomath, 2020. **9**(1): p. 1-12 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.11145/j.biomath.2020.08.173>.
12. Ganiev, T., V. Karyakin, and S. Zadonsky, *MILITARY STANDOFF BETWEEN THE US AND IRAN: THE PARTIES' MILITARY POTENTIALS AND HYPOTHETICAL SCENARIOS OF CONFLICT DEVELOPMENT IN THE MIDDLE EAST*. Central Asia and the Caucasus, 2020. **21**(2): p. 50-65 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.37178/ca-c.20.2.05>.
13. Retnosari, V.A. and A. Jayadi, *Analysis of the Determinants of Indonesia's Exports with ASEAN Countries and Seven Trading Partner Countries Using the Gravity Model*. Cuadernos de Economía, 2020. **43**(123): p. 391-400.
14. Mavin, S. and G. Grandy, *A theory of abject appearance: Women elite leaders' intra-gender 'management' of bodies and appearance*. Human relations, 2016. **69**(5): p. 1095-1120 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0018726715609107>.
15. Astuti, L. and S. Amanah, *The relationship between beauty product advertisements on television*

- and the body orientation of working women. *Jurnal Penyuluhan*, 2009. 5(2) DOI: <https://doi.org/10.25015/penyuluhan.v5i2.11416>.
16. Braun, S. and C. Peus, *Crossover of work–life balance perceptions: does authentic leadership matter?* *Journal of Business Ethics*, 2018. 149(4): p. 875-893 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-016-3078-x>.
 17. Kim, J.-R., *Using Markedness Principle for Abstraction of Dependency Relations of Natural Languages*. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 2021. 7(2): p. 58-67.
 18. Handayani, A., *Family work balance in working women: A review of border theory*. *Buletin Psikologi*, 2013. 21(2): p. 90.
 19. Hawker, F.H., *Female specialists in intensive care medicine: job satisfaction, challenges and work-life balance*. *Critical Care and Resuscitation*, 2016. 18(2): p. 125-131.
 20. Bick, A., *The quantitative role of child care for female labor force participation and fertility*. *Journal of the European Economic Association*, 2016. 14(3): p. 639-668 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1111/jeea.12143>.
 21. Blackburn, J.J., J.C. Bunchm, and J.C. Haynes, *Assessing the Relationship of Teacher Self-Efficacy, Job Satisfaction, and Perception of Work-Life Balance of Louisiana Agriculture Teachers*. *Journal of Agricultural Education*, 2017. 58(1): p. 14-35.
 22. Hutjens, A., N.A. Dentchev, and E. Haezendonck, *CSR implementation in Belgium: Institutional context, the role of CSR managers and stakeholder involvement*, in *Corporate social responsibility in Europe*. 2015, Springer. p. 57-80.
 23. MacIntyre, P.D., W. Lanxi, and G.H. Khajavy, *Thinking fast and slow about willingness to communicate: A two-systems view*. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 2020. 6(3): p. 443-458 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32601/ejal.834681>.
 24. Dewi, P.M., *Participation of female workers in increasing family income*. *Jurnal Ekonomi Kuantitatif Terapan*, 2012. 5(2): p. 44293.
 25. Naz, S., S. Gul, and A. Haq, *RELATIONSHIP OF WORK-FAMILY CONFLICT WITH JOB SATISFACTION AND LIFE SATISFACTION IN HIGH TECH INDUSTRIAL EMPLOYEES*. *International Journal of Academic Research*, 2011. 3(6).
 26. Nguyen, K.D. and U.H.T. Nguyen, *Common Errors in Writing of EFL Sophomores in a Context of the Mekong Delta*. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 2021. 7(2): p. 46-57 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21744/ijllc.v7n2.1353>.
 27. Hollander, M., D.A. Wolfe, and E. Chicken, *Nonparametric statistical methods*. Vol. 751. 2013: John Wiley & Sons.
 28. Lindley, J., *The gender dimension of technical change and the role of task inputs*. *Labour Economics*, 2012. 19(4): p. 516-526 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.labeco.2012.05.005>.
 29. Mondy, R.W. and J.J. Marthocchio, *Human Resource Management (Global Edition). 14th International Edition*. 2016, Pearson Education Limited. United State of America. p. 234-256.
 30. Namayandeh, H., R. Juhari, and S.N. Yaacob, *The effect of job satisfaction and family satisfaction on work-family conflict (W-FC) and family-work conflict (F-WC) among married female nurses in Shiraz-Iran*. *Asian Social Science*, 2011. 7(2): p. 88 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v7n2p88>.
 31. Roberts, A., *The Political Economy of “Transnational Business Feminism” problematizing the corporate-led gender equality agenda*. *International feminist journal of politics*, 2015. 17(2): p. 209-231 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2013.849968>.
 32. Nohe, C., et al., *The chicken or the egg? A meta-analysis of panel studies of the relationship between work–family conflict and strain*. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 2015. 100(2): p. 522 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0038012>.
 33. O’Neil, T. and P. Domingo, *The power to decide: Women, decision-making and gender equality*. Overseas Development Institution, 2015. 31(3).
 34. Oemar, Y., *The Influence of Organizational Culture, Work Ability and Organizational Commitment on Employee Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) at BAPPEDA Pekanbaru City*. *Jurnal Aplikasi Manajemen*, 2013. 11(1): p. 65-76.
 35. Olivetti, C. and B. Petrongolo, *Gender gaps across countries and skills: Demand, supply and the industry structure*. *Review of Economic Dynamics*, 2014. 17(4): p. 842-859 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.red.2014.03.001>.
 36. Paul, M., A. Dutta, and P. Saha, *Workplace spirituality and work-life balance: A Study among women executives of IT Sector Companies*. *International Journal of Management and Behavioural Sciences*, 2015. 6(7): p. 267-277.
 37. Perdana, K. and J. Gunawan, *Proposed integrated measurement standard to measure sustainability performance: evidence from Indonesia*, in *Dimensional Corporate Governance*. 2017, Springer. p. 251-267.

38. Perdana, K. and N. Mardiana, *How managers perceive internal corporate social responsibility: an empirical study of Indonesian women's employment*, in *Redefining Corporate Social Responsibility*. 2018, Emerald Publishing Limited. p. 345.
39. Romero, M., *Unravelling Privilege: Workers' Children and the Hidden Costs of Paid Child Care I. When Care Work Goes Global*, 2016. **17**: p. 117-127 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315547374-7>.
40. Utami, K.P. and Y.D. Wijaya, *Relationship of Spouse's Social Support with Work-Family Conflict in Working Mothers*. *Jurnal Psikologi: Media Ilmiah Psikologi*, 2018. **16**(1) DOI: <https://doi.org/10.30649/jpp.v1i1.5>.
41. Toffoletti, K. and K. Starr, *Women academics and work-life balance: Gendered discourses of work and care*. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 2016. **23**(5): p. 489-504.
42. Wahyuni, R.N.T. and A.K. Monika, *The effect of education on labor income inequality in Indonesia*. *Jurnal Kependudukan Indonesia*, 2017. **11**(1): p. 15-28 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.14203/jki.v11i1.63>.